



Occupation and sexuality--GHQ's policy-making on prostitution

CRUZ, CLAIRE BLOSSOM

(Degree)

博士 (学術)

(Date of Degree)

2009-09-25

(Date of Publication)

2011-11-30

(Resource Type)

doctoral thesis

(Report Number)

甲4782

(URL)

<https://hdl.handle.net/20.500.14094/D1004782>

※ 当コンテンツは神戸大学の学術成果です。無断複製・不正使用等を禁じます。著作権法で認められている範囲内で、適切にご利用ください。



氏 名 CRUZ CLAIRE BLOSSOM

博士の専攻分野の名称 博士（学術）

学 位 記 番 号 博い第 4782 号

学位授与の 要 件 学位規則第 5 条第 1 項該当

学位授与の 日 付 平成 21 年 9 月 25 日

【 学位論文題目 】

Occupation and sexuality--GHQ's policy-making on prostitution 占領と性 G H Q の売春政
策

審 査 委 員

主 査 准教授 金野 美奈子

教 授 宗像 恵

教 授 寺内 直子

教 授 櫻井 徹

准教授 小笠原 博毅

論文内容の要旨

氏名: CRUZ, CLAIRE BLOSSOM

専攻: 人間文化科学

指導教員氏名: 金野 美奈子

論文題目: Occupation and sexuality - GHQ's policy-making on prostitution
(占領と性——GHQ の売春政策)

論文要旨

This paper comprehensively examined GHQ's policy making on prostitution from the start till the end of the American Occupation. It is important to examine prostitution because it is coeval with society, and it has become one of the most controversial issues of our time. As a phenomenon that involves the complex nature of human beings, examining prostitution will lead us to better understand the nature of human beings, and how do people struggle with this issue. In an attempt to continue looking for answers to the problems brought about by prostitution, this paper chose to examine prostitution in Japan, because it receives an intense international criticism when we talk about global and contemporary prostitution issues (such as the "comfort women," foreign women trafficked into Japan's enormous sex industry). Due to these criticisms and stereotyped images of Japan's prostitution system, there is a need to look closely at the history of prostitution in Japan in order to show the significant features of prostitution in contemporary Japanese society, and how the Japanese people struggled with prostitution.

In particular, this paper chose to study prostitution during the American Occupation because this period became a starting point of a major transition in the development of prostitution in Japan, from abolishing licensed prostitution to proliferation of unlicensed prostitutes on the streets and the segregation of brothels into the red-line districts (Tanaka 2002, Lie 1997, Koikari 1999). It is important to examine GHQ's policy making on prostitution in order to show the role played by GHQ in creating a social base of prostitution in Japan after WWII.

This paper found out that aside from the complex bureaucratic structure of GHQ-SCAP (which caused non-consensus among different GHQ officials on how to deal with prostitution), the Occupation's prostitution policies were shaped by various forces and considerations (eg. preconceived notions of US military men on Japan as "feudalistic"; various actors involved; diverse events such as the "reverse course" and Korean War; and other factors which were either directly or indirectly related with prostitution). The preconceived notion on Japan as "feudalistic" and licensed prostitution as a form of debt bondage by the US military men prior to the Occupation was

demonstrated in the way GHQ officials represented licensed prostitution as a practice that suppressed women in Japan during the Occupation.

The examination of GHQ's policy making was based on a division of stages of the Occupation, and the various cultural discourses used by different GHQ officials in their arguments that backed up proposals and policies. During the initial stage (August 1945-July 1947), GHQ's policies were inconsistent and ambiguous, as they imposed a radical policy to end licensed prostitution but tolerated the segregation of brothels into the red-line districts, and at the same time imposed a strict and indiscriminate regulation of women suspected as prostitutes. In drafting their initial policies, they represented Japan as feudalistic and inferior. The effects of their policies indicate a division between civil officials who had (1) idealistic goal to democratize Japan, and the military officials who had (2) practical goal to curb VD among their troops.

In the second stage (August 1947- December 1949), GHQ's policies became lesser punitive after realizing that their initial policies not only failed to curb VD and control prostitution, but also produced contradictory effects to the prostitution system in Japan, the GHQ officials became more cautious in releasing formal orders to the Japanese government. However, this did not stop GHQ officials to release informal and verbal orders to Japanese police in controlling prostitution. This time they represented Japan as having a "different" social and cultural standard. During the last stage (January 1950- April 1952), the conflict among civil and military officials became intense after military officials became desperate to persuade civil section officials to approve their proposals to prohibit solicitation among US troops. The military officials were anxious about the spread of VD among their troops when women concentrated their solicitation near military bases. Since the military officials bore great responsibility in protecting their troops (who were later dispatched to fight in the Korean War), they tried hard to persuade civil section officials to approve proposals prohibiting prostitution by representing Japanese people and American as having common attitude to tolerate segregated districts or red-light districts as the West's equivalent.

However, the Occupation ended without approving the military officials' proposals to legally prohibit prostitution especially solicitation of US troops. In the last stage, several local ordinances controlling prostitution were approved by the Japanese government and the availability of penicillin led to a decrease of VD incidence. So, both the civil and military officials were "saved" from having to deal with prostitution as a multifaceted phenomenon, especially in a crucial period when GHQ had to maintain good relations with Japan as an ally (military base) during the Korean War. This paper also found out that the use of various cultural discourses (cultural superiority, relativity, and commonality) in varied contexts by the different GHQ officials to back up their proposals indicate that "cultural discourses" were used by GHQ officials to pursue their own interests and legitimize their intervention to the prostitution issue in Japan during the American Occupation.

In conclusion, GHQ's policy making on prostitution demonstrates an interesting case which shows how people deal with multifaceted issues related with prostitution. This paper showed that even if an Occupier (such as America) had possessed an enormous political, economic, military power over the occupied nation Japan (in fact, they took advantage of this power imbalance to pursue their own goals and interests), they were not able to solve the prostitution issue. The comprehensive examination of GHQ's policy making lead us to understand that since prostitution mainly involves the sexual aspect of human beings (an "uncontrollable" aspect of human nature), the association of American men (both military officials and enlisted men) with Japanese women who were either prostitutes or non-prostitutes (and vice versa) became an "uncontrollable" aspect of GHQ's policy making, and became one of the biggest challenges.

Aside from the "uncontrollable" aspect of the prostitution issue, GHQ officials had to consider different actors, various events and factors related with the prostitution issue. For example, American military officials preconceived notions on Japan as "feudalistic" and "inferior," internal conflicts in GHQ, and other "outside constraints" (such as the "reverse course" and the outbreak of Korean War, and other local and national issues both in Japan and in the mainland US) were the multifaceted issues that shaped GHQ's policies on prostitution. These issues contributed to the creation of ambiguous and contradictory effects of GHQ's policies to the prostitution system in Japan, and particularly to the gender relations in Japan. For example, one of the effects of abolition of licensed prostitution was the revival of unlicensed prostitutes and streetwalkers and the reorganization of brothels into the red-line districts. When streetwalkers proliferated, GHQ released verbal orders to the Japanese police to indiscriminately arrest women suspected as streetwalkers, which provoked protests from the Japanese human rights' groups.

Even if the Occupation ended, the struggle with prostitution continued to be demonstrated in Japan. For example, it took 8 years for the passing of Japanese anti-prostitution bill (which was first submitted to the Diet in 1948) into a law in 1956. The presence of US military bases in Japan continued as military bases are installed in Okinawa and Yamaguchi prefectures. The presence of US military bases not only created social base of prostitution, but provided a network for sex work to continue near US military establishments in Japan. Since this paper only examined the Occupation period, to trace the history of prostitution in Japan from the end of the Occupation until now would be an interesting topic for a future study. This paper could become a good starting point for a further study relating the history of prostitution in Japan, or contemporary issues on prostitution.

論文審査の結果の要旨

氏 名	クルズ、クレアー ブロッサム		
論文題目	Occupation and Sexuality: GHQ's Policy-making on Prostitution 占領と性 — GHQ の買売春政策		
判 定	合 格・不 合 格		
審 査 委 員	区 分	職 名	氏 名
	主 査	准教授	金野 美奈子
	副 査	教授	宗像 恵
	副 査	教授	寺内 直子
	副 査	教授	櫻井 徹
	副 査	准教授	小笠原 博毅
要 旨			
本研究は、連合国最高司令官総司令部（GHQ/SCAP、以下 GHQ）による買売春をめぐる政策立案過程を、特にそこで示された買売春に対する多様な意味づけに着目しつつ、詳細な資料分析に基づいて明らかにした研究である。 日本社会における買売春のあり方及び関連諸問題は、これまで、国内外で繰り返し議論的となってきた問題であり、日本社会研究の重要な課題の1つであり続けている。本研究が対象とする占領期は、日本の歴史の中で買売春のあり方が大きく変化し戦後の前提が形作られた時期であり、そこには GHQ の対応が深く関わっていたが、その過程がどのようなものであり、GHQ 内でどのような議論がなされていたのかについては、これまで必ずしも十分明らかになっていない。本研究はまた、占領期日本を素材として、軍隊と性をめぐる問題一般に対して新たな示唆を得ようとするものでもある。 一次資料としては主に GHQ 文書を用い、往復文書、交渉内容や問題の背景・経緯等をまとめた覚書、部局間の意思決定や連絡に使われるチェック・シート、施策に対する意見書、各種報告書、執務参考資料など、多岐にわたる文書資料に基づいて分析を行っている。			

【本研究の成果と各章の概要】

本研究の成果は大きく以下の点にまとめられる。第一に、買売春をどのような問題として扱うかについて、GHQ 内部に存在した多様な議論を詳細に跡付けたこと、第二に、時期によって異なる立場が優勢となった様子及びその過程を明らかにしたこと、第三に、そのような過程に影響を与えたと考えられる背景要因を多角的に分析したことである。本論は、GHQ 内部で優勢となった政策的立場の変化をメルクマールとして占領期を 3 期に区分し、分析を行っている。その概要は以下のとおりである。

第一章で GHQ による政策立案過程を理解する前提としての歴史的、組織的背景を考察した後、続く第二章で、GHQ が日本における買売春に関して積極的改革政策を打ち出した時期である第一期における政策とそれをめぐる議論の諸相がまず明らかにされる。占領開始直後に設置された占領軍向け「慰安施設」の存在を受け入れる一方で、占領初期に GHQ の主要政策となったのが公娼制度の廃止であった。GHQ にとって公娼制度は日本の「封建制」の象徴であり、その廃止は「文化後進国日本」の民主化の一環と位置づけられたが、これが結果的に「私的」買売春の顕在化につながり、軍部の当初の対応が日本社会から大きな反発を招くに至って GHQ の政策は大きく転換する。

第三章で検討される第二期以降は「私的」買売春に関する政策に焦点が移り、政策をめぐる議論における GHQ 内部での対立が次第に大きくなる。民生局を中心とする専門部は積極政策を転換し、買売春問題に慎重なスタンスをとるようになるが、このとき、いわゆる「逆コース」の流れの中で日本統治を円滑に進めるという GHQ の政治目的を議論のレベルで支えたのが、文化相対主義の言説であった。一方軍部にとっては、買春による軍隊内での性病蔓延は深刻な問題であり、売春取り締まりの積極策が引き続き求められた。

第四章では占領期終了までの第三期が検討される。この時期になると、朝鮮戦争の開始に伴い、軍事基地周辺における売春活動を禁止する対日指令発令などの措置を望む声が軍部内でさらに強まり、これらは日米双方の文化に共通して見られる買売春観に沿ったものだと主張されたが、民生局はこのような提案に対して否定的な立場を堅持し、むしろ地方レベルでの条例制定を非公式に働きかけることで対応しようとした。他方で公衆衛生局が折衷的立場をとるなど、部局レベルでの対立も露になる。最終的には、ペニシリンの普及によって性病問題が収束に向かったことで、GHQ にとっての買売春問題は終結する。

結論として、本研究は、買売春という現象が占領者にとっても意味がこれまで想定されてきた以上に多面的であったことを浮かび上がらせるものであり、従来ともすれば一面的になりがちでもあった買売春研究の視点に見直しを迫るものである。個別政策にかかわる過程の考察や論理的記述などの点で、さらに展開しうる余地は大きいものの、本研究は、詳細な資料分析による新たな知見の提供、及び先行研究のより包括的な視点からの再検討という点において、博士の学位に値する学術的意義を有すると評価できる。

以上により、本審査委員会は全員一致で、クルズ、クレアー ブロッサム氏の学位申請論文は博士（学術）の学位水準に達していると判定した。

なお、申請者は申請に先立ち、査読付き学術論文を含む以下 2 編の論文を発表している。
『The Representation of Culture in GHQ's Policy Making on Prostitution』、『国際文化学』、第 20 号、pp.1-13、2009 年：『Image of Filipino Women Entertainers in Japan』、『鶴山論叢』、第 7 号、pp.36-56、2007 年。