



Connecting D. H. Lawrence to Emily Brontë: Adoration for Nature and the Shadow of "Death"

山内, 理恵

(Degree)

博士 (学術)

(Date of Degree)

2022-03-25

(Date of Publication)

2023-03-01

(Resource Type)

doctoral thesis

(Report Number)

甲第8232号

(URL)

<https://hdl.handle.net/20.500.14094/D1008232>

※ 当コンテンツは神戸大学の学術成果です。無断複製・不正使用等を禁じます。著作権法で認められている範囲内で、適切にご利用ください。



(別紙様式3)

論 文 要 旨

氏 名 山内 理恵
専 攻 グローバル文化専攻
指導教員氏名 島津 厚久教授

論文題目 (外国語の場合は日本語訳を併記すること)

Connecting D. H. Lawrence to Emily Brontë: Adoration for Nature and the Shadow of "Death" (D. H. ロレンスとエミリー・ブロンテをつなぐ自然愛と「死」の影)

論文要旨

This thesis contends that D. H. Lawrence's works show influences from Emily Brontë and her novel *Wuthering Heights*, and explores the reasons for these influences. Examining their literary reviews, critiques, biographies, works, and Lawrence's letters uncover the resemblances of their literary tastes and life values. Their affection towards nature is especially prominent. Their biographies reveal that their respective lives were frequented by deaths of those who were close to them and threatened by the possibility of their own mortality. Referring to the scientific research on nature's healing power for humans, the thesis proposes that fear of death led Brontë and Lawrence to find comfort in nature. Lawrence, having read *Wuthering Heights* and Elizabeth Gaskell's *The Life of Charlotte Brontë*, must have recognised striking resemblances with himself in Brontë's work and person.

Chapter 1. Overall Critical Tendencies

Both the level of violence in *Wuthering Heights* and that of sexuality in Lawrence's works shocked their contemporary readers. Their controversial choices which put a higher priority on their own literary instincts than on conventions, imply their rebellious attitudes towards contemporary literary manners. As a consequence, they both faced severe criticisms despite the high quality of their literary arts.

Even though it is often only briefly and not in detail that critics have examined Lawrence's connection to Brontë, their shared characteristics emerge by comparing the past critiques on the respective writers. Among them are the keywords such as "Romanticism", "nature", and "prophecy". Their early literary reviews also demonstrate other shared keywords such as "passions / emotions / intensity", "imaginations / creativity", "poetry / lyricism", and "realism / truism". These keywords prove that Brontë and Lawrence had similar literary preferences.

Chapter 2: Gender and Feminism

Brontë and Lawrence were contrastive in many ways, such as in their sexes, their sociability, and the ways they plot and construct their stories. Another contrast among them is that Brontë was rather masculine for a woman of her time and Lawrence rather feminine for a working-class man in his days. This contrast, however, can also be considered a "similarity", as they were both "androgynous": that is, they failed to meet the social expectations on their gender roles and were consequently "outsiders". Lawrence must have noticed the resemblance of his own position with Emily's when he read *The Life of Charlotte Brontë*.

Despite their multiple similarities, feminists tend to regard Brontë and Lawrence contrastively. They consider the former heroically rebellious against the patriarchy, and the latter a despicable misogynist. Kate Millett, an influential feminist, started this negative evaluation of Lawrence in *Sexual Politics*. However, her contention is inaccurate on the point that her arguments excluded Lawrence's sympathetic side with women.

Chapter 3: Love of Nature and Fear of Death

Brontë and Lawrence were attached to nature, that is, both the innate nature of humans and the natural world outside. They valued spontaneous emotions and feelings, and, although Lawrence had a sociable side, they shared a desire for solitude to maintain their own natural selves. They also loved to associate with animals and plants. Lawrence, by reading *Wuthering Heights* and *The Life of Charlotte Brontë*, should have noticed not only Brontë's love of nature, but also her intense way of life and natural vitality, which he considered one of the most essential qualities of life. Their shared distrust in medical science originated from their strong belief in nature's healing power, along with the bitter experiences of losing more than one family members.

Nature functioned for them both as a shelter from daily stress and fear of death. Recent scientific research suggests the psychological and physical benefits of being in or close to natural environments. Gaskell mentioned Emily's dependency on nature to refresh herself, and *Wuthering Heights* reflects this concept of nature as a sanctuary. Nature was a revitalising escape for Lawrence as well, which can be detected in his works and biographies. The thesis also proposes that their strong attachments to nature derive from their fear of mortality, referring to their family members' (especially siblings') deaths, their constant awareness of mortality, and the scientific research on fear of death related to the loss of siblings in childhood.

Chapter 4: The Influence of *Wuthering Heights* on D. H. Lawrence's Works

The comparative analysis of *Wuthering Heights* and two of Lawrence's works, *Kangaroo* and "Jimmy and the Desperate Woman", proves the former's influence on the latter, demonstrating that they contain not only similar themes, images, and wording, but also similar scenes and plots. *Kangaroo* employs the sick-room scene of Cooley which parallels with that of Cathy, and, in "Jimmy and the Desperate Woman", Jimmy's experiences of visiting the Pinnegars form a parallel with the experiences of Lockwood's visit to the Heights.

Kangaroo integrates Brontë's view in *Wuthering Heights* that, even though it is essential for humans to live naturally like animals, such a life is hard to achieve because people are trapped by societal rules and customs. "Jimmy and the Desperate Woman", on the other hand, accords with *Wuthering Heights* in that the less affluent lower-class people's unpretentious attitudes to life are better than the affluent high-class people's intellect-based artificial outlook on life. Death appears in both Brontë's and Lawrence's works, revealing their anxiety about mortality. However, their treatments of death are different in that the former physically kills her characters while the latter prefers to treat death more metaphorically.

In this way, the four chapters support the influence of Emily Brontë and *Wuthering Heights* on Lawrence and his works. It also proposes that, behind Brontë and Lawrence's strong affection towards nature lurks their fear of death. With their shared life values, existential anxiety, and literary preference, it is not surprising that Lawrence felt a strong connection to Brontë when he read *Wuthering Heights* and *The Life of Charlotte Brontë*. It should also be noted that, even though this thesis focusses only on Brontë's influences on him, his works show influences from

multiple other predecessors as well. Having said that, the arguments throughout the thesis confirm that Lawrence received an enduring impact from Emily Brontë and *Wuthering Heights*.

論文審査の結果の要旨

氏名	山内 理恵			
論文題目	Connecting D. H. Lawrence to Emily Brontë: Adoration for Nature and the Shadow of "Death" (D. H. ロレンスとエミリー・ブロンテをつなぐ自然愛と「死」の影)			
判定	合格 ・ 不合格			
論文チェックソフトによる確認	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 確認 <input type="checkbox"/> 未確認 理由:			
審査委員	区分	職名	氏名	論文審査結果について
	委員長	教授	石川 慎一郎	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 確認
	委員	教授	島津 厚久	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 確認
	委員	教授	松家 理恵	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 確認
	委員			<input type="checkbox"/> 確認
	委員			<input type="checkbox"/> 確認
要 旨				
<p>学位申請者山内理恵氏による標記論文（全 212 ページ）は、イギリスの作家 D. H. ロレンス（1885-1930）の作品に、エミリー・ブロンテ（1818-48）の小説 <i>Wuthering Heights</i>（『嵐が丘』1847）からの影響が見られることを指摘し、併せてその要因を両者に関する書評、批評、伝記、また、両者の作品それ自体を検討することを通して探求したものである。論文は、Introduction、Chapter 1-4、Conclusion からなる。</p> <p>山内氏はまず Introduction において、現代批評における「影響」(influence) 概念について概観したのち、「相手方に認識されている、いないにかかわらず文学作品や作家は他の作家に概念的・内在的な力を及ぼす」という、本論文における自身の定義を明らかにしている。</p> <p>Chapter 1 “Overall Critical Tendencies” において山内氏は、『嵐が丘』における暴力性、ロレンス作品に見られる性的関心の横溢は、因習よりも自身の文学的本能に忠実であろうとする両者</p>				

に共通の傾向を示している」と述べ、それゆえ出版当時に両者の作品が厳しい非難を浴びたことを指摘している。さらに、両者に対する様々な批評に共通して現れるキーワード、例えば“Romanticism”、“nature”、“passions / emotions / intensity”、などを丹念に拾い出すことでブロンテとロレンスが類似した文学的傾向を有していたことを立証している。

Chapter 2 “Gender and Feminism” の中で山内氏は、ブロンテが、当時であれば男性的と言いつても得るような気質を備えていた、ロレンスが、病弱だったこともあり、女性性を感じさせる行動を多く示した、という伝記的事実に着目し、両者に共通の「両性具有性」を指摘している。ロレンスはブロンテの男性性に触れた伝記を読んでおり、その際に自身の気質との共通性に気付いたはずであると山内氏は結論付けている。

Chapter 3 “Love of Nature and Fear of Death” において山内氏は、ブロンテとロレンスがどちらも「自然」に魅かれていたという伝記的事実に注目する。ここでの自然とは、『嵐が丘』に顕著に見られるような精神の癒しとしての自然のみならず、内的な自然、つまり、Chapter 1 にも通じる、内発的情緒や感情の重視という姿勢をも含む。一方、二人とも近親者の死をあまた経験し、常に死の存在を自覚せざるを得ない状況にあり、自然が繰り返し顕現させる再生力の中に、死への恐怖に打ち勝つための糧を見出していたと山内氏は述べる。

Chapter 4 “The Influence of *Wuthering Heights* on D. H. Lawrence's Works” では、『嵐が丘』と、ロレンスの2作品、*Kangaroo* (1923) と “Jimmy and the Desperate Woman” (1924) の比較が行われ、両者に共通のテーマ、イメージ、言葉使い、場面、プロットが指摘されている。そういった作業を通して「自然に生きることの大切さと困難さ」、「死への不安」といった、二人の作家に共通の関心事が作品に投影されていることが明らかにされている。

最後に Conclusion において山内氏は改めて議論を振り返り、文学的傾向及び人格面でロレンスがブロンテの中に自分自身との強い類似性を見出したという結論を導いている。

以上、本研究はブロンテとロレンスについて、その影響関係を種々の観点から研究したものであり、伝記的作家・作品研究の有用性について重要な知見を得たものとして価値ある集積であると認める。よって、学位申請者の山内理恵氏は、博士（学術）の学位を得る資格があると認める。なお、後期課程入学後、査読付き論文3編（海外ジャーナル1編を含む）を刊行し、口頭発表も1回行っておりこの点でも要件を満たしていると判断する。